



Security or Separation? Analyzing the West Bank Barrier through Soccer

About the Lesson

Grade Level: High School

Relevant Subject: Social Studies

Time: 50 minutes pre-viewing and viewing, 50 minutes post-viewing

Purpose/Rationale: The Israel-built Separation Wall has proved highly controversial and been challenged by many. This lesson seeks to contextualize the Barrier in both Israeli and Palestinian societies and understand the multiple narratives that exist in the conflict.

Previous Knowledge: This lesson assumes prior knowledge of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and familiarity with the West Bank Barrier.

Goals: Students will ...

- analyze the West Bank Barrier through different lenses

Materials:

- Computer with projector to show YouTube videos
- Copies of “Israeli Group” worksheet (for half the class)
- Copies of “Palestinian Group” worksheet (for half the class)

Curriculum Standards:

Oregon Social Studies Standards

OR.SS.HS.57. Define, research, and explain an event, issue, problem, or phenomenon and its significance to society.

OR.SS.HS.58. Gather, analyze, use, and document information from various sources, distinguishing facts, opinions, inferences, biases, stereotypes, and persuasive appeals.

OR.SS.HS.59. Demonstrate the skills and dispositions needed to be a critical consumer of information.

OR.SS.HS.60. Analyze an event, issue, problem, or phenomenon from varied or opposing perspectives or points of view.

OR.SS.HS.62. Propose, compare, and judge multiple responses, alternatives, or solutions to issues or problems; then reach an informed, defensible, supported conclusion.

OR.SS.HS.63. Engage in informed and respectful deliberation and discussion of issues, events, and ideas.

Common Core State Standards:

SL.9-10.1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on *grades 9–10 topics, texts, and issues*, building on others’ ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.



SL.9-10.2. Integrate multiple sources of information presented in diverse media or formats (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) evaluating the credibility and accuracy of each source.

SL.9-10. 3. Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, identifying any fallacious reasoning or exaggerated or distorted evidence.

SL.9-10. 4. Present information, findings, and supporting evidence clearly, concisely, and logically such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and task.

SL.9-10. 5. Make strategic use of digital media (e.g., textual, graphical, audio, visual, and interactive elements) in presentations to enhance understanding of findings, reasoning, and evidence and to add interest.

SL.9-10. 6. Adapt speech to a variety of contexts and tasks, demonstrating command of formal English when indicated or appropriate. (See grades 9–10 Language standards 1 and 3 on pages 54 for specific expectations.)

SL.11-12.1. Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on *grades 11–12 topics, texts, and issues*, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.)

SL.11-12.2. Integrate multiple sources of information presented in diverse formats and media (e.g., visually, quantitatively, orally) in order to make informed decisions and solve problems, evaluating the credibility and accuracy of each source and noting any discrepancies among the data.

SL.11-12.3. Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, assessing the stance, premises, links among ideas, word choice, points of emphasis, and tone used.

SL.11-12.4. Present information, findings, and supporting evidence, conveying a clear and distinct perspective, such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning, alternative or opposing perspectives are addressed, and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and a range of formal and informal tasks.

SL.11-12. 5. Make strategic use of digital media (e.g., textual, graphical, audio, visual, and interactive elements) in presentations to enhance understanding of findings, reasoning, and evidence and to add interest.

SL.11-12.6. Adapt speech to a variety of contexts and tasks, demonstrating a command of formal English when indicated or appropriate.

About the Videos

This lesson utilizes an Israeli commercial for the large cell-phone company, Cellcom, and a counter-video made by protestors in the Palestinian village of Bil'in (<http://www.bilin-village.org/>). The videos can be found here: <http://mn.breakthebonds.org/?p=204> or on YouTube here:

- Cellcom Commercial: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AH02uc1vB4k&feature=related>.
- Counter-video: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Et8VGyCDt10&feature=related>.



Background Information:

Alon Raab (2010) writes:

In a recent commercial for Israeli cell-phone giant Cellcom, smiling Israeli soldiers play football at the barrier separating Israel from the West Bank.¹ They kick the ball to the other side, and it is promptly returned. The announcer declares, “What, after all, do we all want? A little Keif” (an Arabic word meaning “fun”). The ad was lambasted by activists, who pointed to four years of weekly protests at the villages of Bil’in and Ni’lin, where soldiers often attacked football tournaments, and where Palestinians, Israelis, and Internationalists have been injured and killed. In a counter-video, events are seen from the Palestinian side of the barrier, and it is protesters who first kick the ball to the Israeli side. A title reads, “No friendly over-the-wall football game,” as the soldiers respond by lobbing gas canisters.²

These ads reflect the two faces of football in Israeli and Palestinian film and literature. Despite a variety of portrayals, two parallel narratives have developed that each side has told itself and the other about the right to the land, whose suffering is greater, and the many wars and efforts toward peace.

To read the whole article, visit: <http://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Sports%20in%20ME.pdf>
For more information about the Separation Wall, click on the links below:

- What is the West Bank Barrier? BBC (2005).
http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/3111159.stm
- Bard, Michael (2010) Israel’s Security Fence, Jewish Virtual Library.
<http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Peace/fence.html%20>
- Two Views of the West Bank Barrier, PBS Newshour,
http://www.pbs.org/newshour/indepth_coverage/middle_east/conflict/map_westbank.html

Note to teachers:

It is important that you remain neutral throughout the lesson and let students make their own decisions on the West Bank Barrier. The Israeli group’s sheets all refer to the wall as a Security Wall while the Palestinian group’s sheets call the wall a Separation Wall. To remain neutral, it is best for the teacher to call it the West Bank Barrier.

Lesson Plan: Security or Separation?

Pre-viewing Activity:

- Begin with a brief review of the West Bank Barrier (use articles above or other text as desired).
- Divide students into four groups—two groups will represent Israelis and two groups will represent Palestinians. Explain to the class that they’ll be participating in a role play. Ask each group to take on the role of their assigned character (as Israeli or Palestinian) and discuss their opinion of the West Bank Barrier. They can use the guiding questions on the sheet below.



Viewing—Video 1:

- Explain to your students that they’ll be watching an Israeli commercial that feature the West Bank Barrier. Tell them that there are only a few words in the commercial (in Hebrew) and it’s not important to understand them. They should use other clues to understand the commercial.
- Show the commercial. After the commercial, ask the students what they saw.
- Watch the commercial a second time. As you’re watching, stop when the soccer ball comes over a second time (at 21 seconds), when the soldier calls “*Yallah, hevve, balagan!*” This means: “come on guys, let’s go!” Continue watching. Translate the final line for them (44 sec), *mah Misachakol kulanu rotz'im, she yibiyeh ktzat keif*, “We all want a little fun in our lives! Cellcom”

Post Viewing:

- Have the students return to their group and discuss the commercial from the perspective of the group. Tell them to use the questions on the other side of their sheet to guide their conversation.

Viewing—Video 2:

- Explain to your students that this commercial was very controversial in Israel and around the world. A Palestinian activist group made a video to counter the Cellcom commercial. The video is meant to show the commercial from the Palestinian side of the wall.
- Show the commercial. After the commercial, ask the students what they saw.
- Watch the commercial a second time. As you’re watching, stop when the soccer ball comes over a second time (at 24 seconds), when someone calls “*Yallah, hevve, balagan!*” this means: “come on guys, let’s go!” Continue watching. Translate the final line for them (47 sec), *mah Misachakol kulanu rotz'im, she yibiyeh ktzat keif*, “We all want a little fun in our lives! Cellcom.” You can point out that it’s the same words as in the Israeli commercial

Post Viewing:

- Have the students return to their group and discuss the counter-video from the perspective of the group. Tell them to use the questions on the other side of their sheet to guide their conversation.

Debate:

- Tell the students that the two Israeli groups and two Palestinian groups will engage in a debate over the two videos.
 - Israeli group 1—defends the commercial
 - Israeli group 2—opposes the counter video
 - Palestinian group 1—defends the counter video
 - Palestinian group 2—opposes the commercial



- Explain the format of the debate and requirements for each group. Each group should prepare an opening statement and develop points of their argument. Give students time in class or assign the research as homework. (You can choose the format that best fits you and your class to hold the debate. For ideas on debate formats, visit: http://www.educationworld.com/a_lesson/03/lp304-01.shtml)
- Conduct debate

Closing

- Conduct final discussion with students emphasizing the complications of the issue regarding the different and equally valid perspectives and narratives of the Israelis and Palestinians.



Israeli Group

Imagine you are an Israeli citizen. You served in the Israeli army a couple years ago and now study at Tel Aviv University and work part time as a receptionist at a doctor's office. You have lost an uncle to violence in the West Bank and have multiple friends who were injured during their army service. You currently volunteer with One Family (onefamilytogether.org), an Israeli organization that supports families affected by terrorism.

Please answer the following questions:

1. Why do you support the Security Wall?
2. How has your experience serving in the Israeli army impacted your support for the Security Wall?
3. The Palestinians call the Security Wall a Separation Wall. Why do you think that is? What is the difference?
4. Why do you suppose others oppose the Security Wall?
5. What would you say about the Security Wall to people who oppose it? How would you convince them to change their mind?



Video 1

After you've watched video 1, answer the questions together:

1. What happened in the video?
2. What did you think of the video?
3. Why do you think people thought the commercial was offensive?
4. What would you say to people who found it offensive?

Video 2

After you've watched video 2, answer the questions together:

1. What happened in the video?
2. What did you think of the video?
3. Did you find this counter-video offensive? Why/why not?
4. What would you say to the people who made this video?



Palestinian Group

Imagine you are a Palestinian living with your family in a village near Bethlehem, on the other side of the Separation Wall. You used to study at Bethlehem University but the presence of the Wall and increase of checkpoints has tripled your travel time to school and made it near impossible to get there regularly. Your aunt and uncle's home was demolished during the construction of the Separation Wall and they have moved in with you and your family. You volunteer with an activist group that organizes protests against the Israeli military and settlers.

Please answer the following questions:

1. Why do you oppose the Separation Wall?
2. How has your experience volunteering for an activist group impacted your opinion of the Separation Wall?
3. The Israelis call the Separation Wall a Security Wall. Why do you think that is? What is the difference?
4. Why do you suppose others support the Wall?
5. What would you say about the Wall to people who support it? How would you convince them to change their mind?



Video 1

After you've watched video 1, answer the questions together:

1. What happened in the video?
2. What did you think of the video?
3. Many Palestinians found this commercial offensive. Would you agree?
4. What would you like to say to Cellcom about the commercial?

Video 2

After you've watched video 2, answer the questions together:

1. What happened in the video?
2. What did you think of the video?
3. What is this video trying to say to the Israeli commercial?
4. Do you think the counter video is effective in making its point? Why/not?